

The Classical Weekly

Published weekly, on Mondays, except in weeks in which there is a legal or a School holiday, from October 1 to May 31, at Barnard College, New York City. Subscription price, \$2.00 per volume.

Entered as second-class matter November 18, 1907, at the Post Office, New York, N. Y., under the Act of Congress of March 3, 1879.

Acceptance for mailing at special rate of postage provided for in Section 1103, Act of October 3, 1917, authorized on June 28, 1918.

VOL. XV, No. 22

MONDAY, APRIL 17, 1922

WHOLE NO. 418

JULIUS CAESAR

HIS LIFE FROM 80 B. C. TO 44 B. C.

A Photo-Masterpiece in Six Reels

Posed and Executed in and about Rome, Italy

From the

GEORGE KLEINE CYCLE OF FILM CLASSICS

This film can be rented at reasonable rates by institutions and other exhibitors in New York State and New England from our New York office; in the State of Illinois, from our Chicago office.

Copies of the film have been deposited with the following Institutions, which supply exhibitors in their respective States at moderate rental prices:

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN
Madison, Wisconsin

STATE COLLEGE OF WASHINGTON
Pullman, Washington

UNIVERSITY OF OHIO
Athens, Ohio

UNIVERSITY OF MONTANA
Missoula, Montana

UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY
Lexington, Kentucky

UNIVERSITY OF UTAH
Salt Lake City, Utah

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA
Gainesville, Florida

NORTH DAKOTA AGRICULTURAL
COLLEGE
Fargo, North Dakota

MISSISSIPPI AGRICULTURAL AND
MECHANICAL COLLEGE
Agricultural College, Mississippi

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS
Lawrence, Kansas

UNIVERSITY OF INDIANA
Bloomington, Indiana

UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA
Norman, Oklahoma

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
Berkeley, California

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Raleigh, North Carolina

UNIVERSITY OF IOWA
Iowa City, Iowa

UNIVERSITY OF OREGON
Eugene, Oregon

Arrangements are being made to cover those States which are not included in the above list.

GEORGE KLEINE

New York: 145 West 45th Street

Chicago: 116 So. Michigan Avenue

D'OOGE AND EASTMAN'S "CAESAR IN GAUL"

Comprises in a single volume all material needed for the second year of Latin
Aims to promote efficiency by excluding unserviceable material
Eliminates obstacles by changing indirect to direct discourse in Books I and II
Supplements and explains the text with excellent illustrations
Abounds in well-drawn maps and battle plans
Reviews first-year syntax through a simple Latin biography of Caesar

Its introduction makes vivid the life of Caesar and his time
Notes, adequate in number, are written from the standpoint of the *pupil*

Grammar, complete for Caesar, follows the text
Ample provision is made for sight reading and composition
Unusual attractiveness characterizes the make-up of the book
Latin study is made an inspiration and a pleasure through its use

GINN AND COMPANY

70 Fifth Ave.

New York

PLACE'S BEGINNING LATIN makes the right kind of impression on the pupil because it at once shows him that Latin is a vital force in his own language—English. It gives interesting and novel "helps" in his studying. It does not merely hint or suggest to the pupil the very human and pulsating life of ancient Rome—it imparts it directly to his imagination and understanding.

*This beginner's book means greater desire
on the part of the pupil to know Latin*

BEGINNING LATIN—By PERLEY OAKLAND PLACE, Litt.D.
 416 Pages 144 illustrations Five pages of color illustrations

AMERICAN BOOK COMPANY

NEW YORK

CINCINNATI

CHICAGO

BOSTON

ATLANTA

The Classical Weekly

VOL. XV, No. 22

MONDAY, APRIL 17, 1922

WHOLE NO. 418

PERIODICALS SUPPORTING THE CAUSE OF THE CLASSICS¹

Two publications of the University of Iowa have contained material of interest to teachers of the Classics. Professor Ullman's Occasional Letters to *Iowa Teachers* are continued by Letter No. 9, dated November 14, 1921. The letter announces that the Extension Division has available for distribution the films Julius Caesar and Last Days of Pompeii. Letter No. 10 was published on January 24, 1922. The Fourth Annual Conference of the Latin Teachers of Iowa was to be held at Iowa City, on March 10-11. The chief speakers were to be Professors F. W. Kelsey and W. L. Carr. Iowa is to be the State wherein an intensive survey is to be undertaken as a check on the national Latin Investigation. Some of the Service Bulletins issued by the University contain items of interest. A new periodical, the Philological Quarterly, has just been established at the same institution as an additional outlet for the productive activity of American scholars. The first number, issued January, 1922, contains a paper by Professor Ullman on The Vatican Manuscript of Caesar, Pliny, and Sallust and the Library of Corbie, and a review of Professor Tenney Frank's Economic History of Rome, by J. S. Magnuson.

The Department of Ancient Languages of the University of Arizona published Series II, No. 1, of its News Letter on December 1, 1921. It begins with this statement:

Three facts furnish teachers of Latin cause for self-congratulation. (1) The need of that kind of education which the study of Latin can help to furnish is certain to be more clearly recognized in the near future. (2) A more intelligent interest in the study of Latin is becoming manifest. (3) Aids to the more effective teaching of Latin are soon to be forthcoming.

Confirmation of the first two points is found in the speech of Vice-President Coolidge, of the third point, in the Latin Investigation.

The Department of Classical Languages of Ohio University (Athens) also issues a News Letter. Vol. II, No. 2, dated November 30, 1921, has in a Supplement some interesting material for Latin bulletin boards. There is also a brief report of a conference of Latin teachers of Southeastern Ohio.

The Department of Latin of the University of Pittsburgh has continued to publish its News Letter, now in its third year. No. 1, dated September 1, 1921, offers suggestions to the teacher, looking to better teaching. It also gives a brief report of Vice-President Coolidge's address and of the defence of the Classics

by Chief Justice Taft, given out through the Register-Public Ledger Service, Philadelphia. Mr. Taft finds the justification of Latin in the fact that it is the source of nearly half the English vocabulary, that it is the best guide to grammar and to the Romance languages, and in its value as a discipline. No. 2, issued November 1, 1921, contains a letter from Professor H. S. Scribner urging the claims of Greek in the High School, and a report of an article in the Springfield Republican entitled The Classics a Remedy for Nationalism. No. 3, of November 15, 1921, contains a list of novels of interest to teachers of Latin and ancient history, prepared by Mr. Harold W. Gilmer. In No. 4, dated December 1, 1921, the problem of translation as a test of comprehension is briefly discussed, and in No. 5, issued February 15, 1922, there are reports of three papers of interest to teachers. The first is A Study of One Thousand Errors in Latin Prose Composition, by Mr. C. W. Odell, printed in School and Society, December 31, 1921. Mr. Odell finds, among other things, that 23% of the errors were due to faulty reasoning, 34% to imperfect memory, and 43% to carelessness. A second paper is by Mr. Alvah Talbot Otis, in the January number of The School Review, giving the results of some English tests which revealed a considerable superiority for Latin students. The third paper, by Francis J. Donnelly, S. J., published in America for June 11, 1921, urges increased emphasis on the literary side of the Classics as a means of general training. Occasional numbers of Modern Languages, Gossip and News, from the same institution, contain items of interest to Latin teachers.

The Indiana State Committee of Latin Teachers has issued, as a bulletin of the Extension Division, Indiana University, a pamphlet containing an announcement of the plans of the Committee.

Several High Schools have Latin publications or give space to Latin activities in their School papers. Thus the Schenley Triangle (Schenley High School, Pittsburgh), and the papers of the Marietta (O.) Junior High School, New Concord (O.) High School, and others give space to the classical clubs. Students of the Male High School, Reading, Pa., under the guidance of Mr. G. E. Kramlich, published in June, 1921, a pamphlet containing cuts, classical club programs, and original contributions in Latin. The Latin Club of the Louisville Male High School publishes a Bulletin, sometimes mimeographed, sometimes printed. Vol. I, No. 9, dated April 27, 1921, is devoted mainly to the Latin Contest conducted by the Club. Vol. II, No. 3, of November 16, 1921, contains an account of Palamedes, a description (somewhat inexact) of certain Pompeian Wall in-

¹See THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 15.1-2, 8-9.

scriptions, and other material. The Boys' High School, Brooklyn, has its publication, *Forum Latinum*. Vol. III, No. 2, dated November, 1921, has an English article on the Roman School, the rest being in Latin. The drawings are not above criticism. The same is true of those in Vol. III, No. 3 (December, 1921), which also contains a mixture of Latin and English.

UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH

EVAN T. SAGE

A REPORT OF PROGRESS IN A NUMBER OF SPECIAL PROJECTS CONNECTED WITH THE CLASSICAL INVESTIGATION

In a previous article, entitled *The Testing-Program Involved in the Latin Investigation Now Under Way*, *THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY* 15.41-43, the portion of the Investigation which involves the giving of a series of tests and the measurement of progress based upon the results was described in detail.

Many other phases of the Investigation are now well under way, under the direction of various Institutions and individual teachers. In the Preliminary Report submitted by the Special Investigators the statement was made that only through the cooperation of large numbers of men and women in the fields of Education and of Latin could the Committee hope to carry out any considerable part of its program. That this cooperation has been forthcoming is indicated clearly by the outline of projects given in the present article. We take occasion now to express the keen appreciation of the Advisory Committee and of the Special Investigating Committee of the very generous cooperation which has been vouchsafed.

The following projects are now launched, and the Committee is confident that the great majority of them will be brought to a successful culmination.

(1) A cooperative study to determine, on the basis of frequency and rank, the 25,000 most important English words, under the direction of Professor Edward L. Thorndike and Miss Ethel Newcomb, of the Institute of Educational Research, Teachers College, Columbia University, with the cooperation of 200 teachers of Latin, working in groups in New York State, Philadelphia, Boston, Topeka (Kansas), and Richmond (Kentucky). The cooperating teachers have been organized by Dr. Clyde R. Jeffords, Newtown High School, New York City, Dr. Arthur W. Howes, Central High School, Philadelphia, Dr. Albert S. Perkins, Dorchester High School, Boston, Mr. Wren J. Grinstead, Kentucky State Normal School, Richmond, Kentucky, and Miss Laura L. Ewing, High School, Topeka, Kansas. About 20 other teachers are collaborating individually in other parts of the country.

(2) A cooperative study involving the collection, study, analysis, and organization for teaching purposes of Latin words and phrases found in contemporary English reading, conducted by Miss Lou V. Walker, Graduate Student in the Department of Latin, University of Wisconsin, with the cooperation of 125 teachers, under the general direction of Professor M. S. Slaughter, Department of Latin, and Professor V. A. C.

Henmon, Department of Education, University of Wisconsin.

(3) A cooperative study involving the collection, analysis, and organization for teaching purposes of the classical ideas and allusions in such contemporary English reading as falls within the range of the High School student, conducted by Miss Ruth B. King and Miss Margaret Bunyan, Graduate Students in the Department of Latin, University of Wisconsin, with the cooperation of 100 Latin teachers, under the direction of Professor Frances E. Sabin, University of Wisconsin.

(4) A cooperative study to result in the construction of a classical lexicon with English derivatives based upon an etymological analysis of the New Oxford (Murray's) English Dictionary, by twenty-five Latin teachers in and near Chicago, under the leadership of Mr. A. W. Smalley, Graduate Student in the University of Chicago, Hyde Park High School, with the assistance of Professors Beeson, Bonner, and Buck, University of Chicago.

(5) An analysis by five thousands of the 25,000 most important English words (see 1, above), by Mr. Edward Y. Lindsay, Miss Belle Coulter, and three others yet to be assigned, Graduate Students in the Departments of Education and Latin, under the joint direction of Dean H. Lester Smith, School of Education, and Professor S. E. Stout, Department of Latin, Indiana University.

(6) A series of studies connected with the teaching of English spelling through Latin, by Mr. W. L. Coxe, Graduate Student in the Department of Education, Ohio State University, under the direction of Professor B. R. Buckingham, Bureau of Educational Research, College of Education, Ohio State University, as follows:

(a) The construction of a series of four tests to measure growth in the ability of High School pupils to spell English words of Latin derivation.

(b) The conduct of spelling-tests in a number of Schools throughout the country to determine the relative rate of progress in ability to spell, made by Latin and non-Latin pupils, and to determine the most effective methods by which Latin can be made an instrument in the teaching of English spelling, by an analysis of the content and methods employed in the Schools making the greatest gain.

(c) A controlled experiment in a few selected Schools in and near Columbus for the explicit purpose of determining the most effective methods in using Latin to assist English spelling.

(d) Contemporaneously a study to determine those English words to the spelling of which a knowledge of Latin can furnish aid, and, as a complement of this study, the determination of the Latin words the capacity of which for assisting in English spelling is the greatest.

(7) The construction and administration of tests for the purpose of measuring the effect of the study of Vergil upon the development of literary appreciation, and a determination of those methods of teaching Vergil which have proved most effective in cultivating this appreciation, by Miss Barbara M. Hahn, Central High School, Springfield, Mass., under the direction of Professor Allan Abbott, of the Department of English, Teachers College, Columbia University.

(8) An experiment to establish by prognostic tests, checked and controlled by progress tests, whether it is possible to predict the success or the failure of pupils electing Latin as the foreign language, and thus to decrease by a wise selection the percentage of mortality in the first term of the subject, conducted by the Latin Department of the Boys' High School, Brooklyn, New York, with the counsel and assistance of Professor Thomas H. Briggs, Teachers College, Columbia University. The tests themselves are being worked out by Mr. W. S. Allen, Graduate Student in Teachers College.

(9) A study based upon controlled experiments for the purpose of determining the most effective method of teaching in connection with Latin a knowledge of less familiar words derived from Latin, and in particular to determine the extent to which there may be expected an automatic transfer of the facts learned in Latin to a knowledge of English derivatives. The study is being made by Mr. A. A. Hamblen, Graduate Student in the Department of Education, University of Pennsylvania, under the direction of Professor Arthur J. Jones, Department of Education, University of Pennsylvania.

(10) A study based upon a controlled experiment for the purpose of determining the most effective method of teaching a knowledge of less familiar words derived from Latin in connection with the regular work in English, and in particular to determine to what extent a study of word-analysis and of Latin roots, prefixes, and suffixes is of value for this purpose, and the best methods of presenting this material to non-Latin pupils. This study is being conducted by Mr. R. I. Haskell, Graduate Student in the Department of Education, University of Pennsylvania, under the direction of Professor Arthur J. Jones.

(11) The construction of tests in Latin inflections, by Miss Caroline Tyler, Graduate Student in the Department of Education, Ohio State University, under the direction of Professor Sidney L. Pressey, Department of Psychology.

(12) The construction of tests in Latin composition, by Miss Edith R. Godsey, Graduate Student in the Department of Latin, University of Kansas, under the direction of Professor Arthur T. Walker, Department of Latin, and Professor F. J. Kelly, Department of Education.

(13) The construction of a Latin comprehension test, by Professor Wren J. Grinstead, Kentucky State Normal School, Richmond, Kentucky.

(14) The construction, under the direction of Professor Thomas J. Kirby, Department of Education, and Professor B. L. Ullman, Department of Latin, State University of Iowa, of tests to measure the ability of Latin pupils to get the thought from Latin sentences and paragraphs without the additional problem of translation.

(15) The construction of a Latin sentence test, by Professor Evan T. Sage, Department of Latin, University of Pittsburgh.

(16) A study, under the direction of Dr. L. L. Thurstone, Department of Psychology, Carnegie

Institute of Technology, to determine the effect of the study of Latin upon growth in reasoning power, as measured by tests based upon graded passages of English prose of considerable difficulty dealing with socially significant data, the result to be measured both quantitatively and qualitatively.

(17) A study, under the direction of Dr. W. W. Charters, Department of Educational Research, Carnegie Institute of Technology, of grammatical errors found in English compositions and English grammar tests written by High School pupils. The purpose is to determine to what extent these errors involve principles which are involved also in an understanding of the elements of Latin grammar.

(18) A study, under the direction of Professor B. L. Ullman, Department of Latin, and Professor Thomas J. Kirby, Department of Education, State University of Iowa, to determine by controlled experiments what content and what method in the teaching of Latin can be made to contribute most effectively to a knowledge of the principles of English grammar and to correct expression in English.

(19) The construction, under the direction of Professor S. B. Davis, Department of Education, and Professor Evan T. Sage, Department of Latin, University of Pittsburgh, of a test to measure the extent to which Latin pupils studying Caesar and Cicero understand the larger historical implications involved in the course.

(20) A study, under the direction of Professor V. A. C. Henmon, School of Education, University of Wisconsin, based upon controlled experiments for the purpose of determining the most effective methods of making a knowledge of Latin contribute to the mastery of French.

(21) A study, under the direction of Professor V. A. C. Henmon, to determine the most common French words the learning of which will best be assisted by a knowledge of related Latin words, and, as a complement of this study, the determination of the Latin words the potential capacity of which to assist in the mastery of a French vocabulary is greatest.

(22) The construction, under the direction of Professor S. A. Leonard, Department of English, University of Wisconsin, of a translation-scale for the use of Latin teachers in rating the quality of oral and written translations, the scale to be accompanied by explanatory notes and comments on typical problems presented in translating the passages included.

(23) A study, by Mr. Dorrance S. White, with the cooperation of the teachers of Minneapolis, of certain features of the Brown Latin Sentence Test used in the survey of the Schools of New Hampshire. This study involves a rating of 500 test papers to determine the correlation between Mr. Brown's published scores, which were based upon the Latin sentence as a unit, and scores to be secured on the basis of partial credits.

(24) The construction of a score-card to be used in securing from a large number of qualified Latin teachers throughout the country their opinion as to the relative importance year by year of the 26 objectives published in Section B of the Preliminary

Report of the Investigating Committee (see The Classical Journal 17.22-25 [October, 1921]). This score-card is being prepared by a Committee of The New York Classical Club, Dr. Barclay W. Bradley, College of the City of New York, Chairman.

(25) A study involving the construction of a test to be used in measuring the effect of the study of Latin upon the development of certain ideals, such as patriotism, fidelity, social service, selfsacrifice, or, in other words, the "emotional attitudes of pupils toward social situations". This study is being developed by a Committee of The New York Classical Club, Dr. Barclay W. Bradley, College of the City of New York, Chairman.

(26) A study, conducted by Mr. Warren B. Rodney, Graduate Student in the Department of Education, University of Rochester, under the supervision of Dr. L. A. Peckstein, Department of Education, of the 10,000 words in Thorndike's Teacher's Word Book, to determine the Latin words which interpret the largest number of words in this list, and the relative proportion of Latin, Greek, and Anglo-Saxon words among these 10,000. This study is in a large measure a deliberate duplication of No. 5 above, to secure a check on that study.

(27) A study, under the direction of Professor S. E. Stout, of Indiana University, to determine at what point in the list of Latin derivatives contained in the 10,000 words of Thorndike's Teacher's Word Book it may be reasonably assumed that pupils beginning Latin are familiar with the majority of words up to that point and unfamiliar with the majority of words after that point.

(28) A study, under the direction of Dr. W. W. Charters, Carnegie Institute of Technology, Pittsburgh, to determine through group-interviews the best opinions of experienced teachers as to the most effective methods for developing in pupils the various mental traits commonly ascribed to the study of Latin.

(29) A diagnostic analysis of the answer papers in Latin II, III, and IV given by the Regents of New York State. This is under the direction of Mr. S. Dwight Arms, State Department of Education, New York State, Mr. Elmer E. Bogart, Principal, Morris High School, New York City, and Mr. J. C. Morrison, State Department of Education, New York.

(30) A study, conducted by Professor Alexander J. Inglis, of Harvard University, designed to measure the effect of the study of Latin upon work done by first-year pupils in other subjects, similar to the Mathematics experiment conducted by Mr. Marsh, and described in *Educational Administration and Supervision*, for November, 1921, pages 458 ff.

(31) A study, carried on under the direction of Professor M. V. O'Shea, of the University of Wisconsin, to determine the extent to which graduates of Colleges have since graduation made use of their knowledge of Latin for professional purposes or for personal enjoyment.

(32) A similar study, carried on under the direction of Professor M. V. O'Shea, with regard to High School graduates.

(33) A study, carried on directly by the Special Investigators, to determine the percentage of Latin pupils who presumably will at some time during their High School course study each of the following subjects: French, Spanish, German, Biology, Physics, Chemistry, General Science, Geography or Physiology, Mathematics, Music, and Commercial Subjects.

(34) A study, conducted by Professor Frances E. Sabin and Professor W. L. Uhl, University of Wisconsin, to determine the relative amounts of time spent in the preparation of lessons in Latin and in the preparation of lessons in other subjects of the curriculum.

(35) An analysis of typical examination papers (question papers) secured by random sampling from Schools of all types in all parts of the country. The purpose is to determine the relative importance attached by teachers to the various immediate and ultimate objectives.

(36) A study, directed by Dr. M. B. Hillegas, Teachers College, Columbia University, to determine the standard of English used in translating the Latin passages in the examinations of the College Entrance Board and in the Regents' examinations of New York State.

(37) A study, at present under the direction of the Special Investigators, to determine the relative interest of pupils in the various authors read in High School and the relative emphasis given in the classroom to the various elements of the Latin work.

(38) A study, at present carried on by the Special Investigators, of the courses in the training of teachers now offered in Colleges and Normal Schools.

(39) A study, at present limited to Iowa State University, under the direction of President Jessup, to determine the effect of the previous study of Latin upon the mastery of modern foreign languages in College.

Special Investigating Committee
W. L. CARR MASON D. GRAY
W. V. McDUFFIE ANDREW F. WEST,
Chairman.

THE TESTING OF EDUCATIONAL VALUES

The extensive program undertaken by the American Classical League to enlist Schools the country over in formal tests of the educational value of the study of Latin is bringing this whole subject more sharply than ever before to the attention of teachers of the Classics.

In view of the fact that this Investigation is just in its inception, it is, to say the least, surprising and unfortunate that one of the chief investigators should seem to attempt to prejudge the whole case, as has

been done in *The Classical Journal* 17. 52-65 (November, 1921), in an article entitled *The Function of Latin in the Secondary Curriculum*, by Dr. Mason D. Gray, which consists largely of a violent attack upon Latin as now taught¹.

Presumably the American Classical League was launching upon a calm, dispassionate measurement of the values realized through present methods of teaching Latin; but here we are assured in advance that our critics are right, and that these values are nil—the one possibility of salvation being along the lines of the report of the Committee on the Junior High School Syllabus in Latin for New York State, according to which Latin is no longer to be taught as an end in itself, but must be made a *corpus vile* for drill in the derivation of words and other forms of training.

As said above, it is unfortunate that the case should thus be prejudiced at the very start. For the experimental test of educational values is yet very far from having attained the position of an exact science; and an investigator who begins work with a strong bias is almost sure to find confirmation of his own views.

Under these conditions it becomes necessary to reach some general understanding as to aims and purposes of the League in this Investigation; and, to this end, the following questions are proposed:

(1) Is it desired and intended that there shall be an adequate and unprejudiced measurement of the values realized from Latin as taught now and in the past?

(2) Is it good policy to join forces with the bitterest foes of Latin in order to push more effectively the claims of some one particular method?

(3) As to educational tests in general, to what extent have results justified confidence in the methods followed?

(4) Would good teachers of Latin care to continue the work, if forced to follow some such plan as is outlined in Dr. Gray's *Introductory Lessons in High School English and Latin*?

(5) Granting the willingness to try, would teachers of the rank and file be able to teach any *Latin* with such a method?

(6) Is it true that the fate of Latin in the Schools turns primarily upon the question of method?

Obviously a whole volume would hardly suffice for a full discussion of the above questions. Within the limits of a short article only a few points can be considered briefly, following the numbering as given above.

(1) This question must be answered by those in control of the Investigation. But it should be noted that, if the other Investigators of the American Classical League share the views of Dr. Gray, we cannot hope that the present Investigation will result in a dispassionate and impartial measurement that will

¹Since the above was submitted for publication, the writer has learned in a round-about way that Dr. Gray prefers to have his paper regarded merely as an expression of personal opinion. The fact remains, however, that the paper went to press several months after the appointment of Special Investigators by the American Classical League, and on page 62, footnote 2, the League Investigation is definitely linked with the program outlined in the article. Here, certainly, there is room for very serious misunderstanding, and what is written above should be read in the light of these circumstances.

adequately bring out the educational value of Latin as taught now and in the past.

(2) and (3). As to the reliability of formal measurements as a basis for hasty curriculum changes, one needs only to point to the mistakes that were made by the over-zealous educationalists who based a reform program upon the now generally discredited early conclusions of Professor E. L. Thorndike.

Or, to take an example from the paper now under discussion, Professor Starch is quoted (59) as having "demonstrated" that Latin is of no appreciable benefit to the student who undertakes the study of one of the Romance languages.

A reference to Professor Starch's test shows that it consists of listing students who took French, for example, dividing them into two groups, Latin and non-Latin. He discovers with manifest pleasure that the students with Latin training surpass in French by "only" about two per cent., and concludes (note the scientific accuracy of this) that "probably" any superiority shown is due, not to the training in Latin, but to the fact that the students who elect Latin are naturally more able.

Of this pitiful performance Dr. Gray says (60):

Starch concludes that "the aid of one language in the study of another is only incidental and unimportant", but he adds the important reservation, *which represents precisely my contention*², "at least so far as present methods of teaching foreign languages go".

That Dr. Gray enters upon the Investigation fully committed to a "contention" of this sort augurs ill for the impartiality of the study; and it is a matter for profound regret that he should thus make common cause with the enemies of humanistic studies, and on the basis of such trivial reasoning.

The educational world has all but gone mad in the matter of hasty readjustments to fit some theory evolved by over-night experiments. Indeed, we might almost be pardoned for expecting to wake up some morning to find that the teaching of commercial arithmetic must be reformed, because someone has made the following startling 'discovery': $3 \times 0 = 2 \times 0$; cancel the common factor, and $3 = 2$. Usually the more absurd the 'discovery', the more fanatical the zeal to 'reform' on the new basis. In this (educational) day and generation it is all-important to be up-to-date; being right is quite another matter.

As to Professor Starch's test, granting that the group of students whose records he examined is typical, the fact that a pupil with Latin background achieves in French a grade only slightly higher than one without such background does not by any means prove that the Latin student derives no help from his previous training.

For, if two students have an original aptitude in any way commensurate, for language study, the chances are that the one who is taking his first foreign language, if he will pay the price, can attain a grade very nearly as high as his fellow who has had experience with another foreign language. But this is not

²The Italics are mine.

the point with which we are now concerned. What of the matter of economy of time and effort?

In the case of two languages related as Latin and French are there can be but one answer to this question. The student who has learned Latin is at a marked advantage in attacking French; there is abundance of 'transfer' all along the line—and without any conscious effort of the teacher to bring about this result.

It seems almost incredible that a preconceived idea should blind anyone to a fact so patent as this. If concrete evidence is desired, one has only to turn to the exhibit prepared by Miss Sabin to show the Latin elements underlying an average passage from some Romance language. It is absolutely impossible for a student to master Latin without acquiring a stock in trade that will help him immensely in the attack upon French or Spanish.

There has been brought to the writer's attention a wholly unpremeditated 'test' that drives this point home with telling force. The report was made by a friend of the person tested, and the details have been carefully checked.

A certain teacher, trained in Latin, but with classes in a non-language subject, desired to qualify through a civil service examination for another position. One of the requirements was a working knowledge of a modern foreign language, the applicant being allowed "a reasonable use of the dictionary".

This teacher had had two years of German at an earlier time, and planned to take the examination in that subject; but, on looking over the paper, found it impossible to do anything with it. As passing the examination was not a matter of vital import, the teacher started idly to glance through the other foreign language papers, among others that in Spanish. Here, though that language had previously not been studied at all, some familiar things were noted; with a little piecing together sense began to appear, and on a *Latin basis* a paper was written that won a pass mark in the civil service test².

In the light of these facts, it is truly interesting to learn from Professor Starch that he has "demonstrated" that "the aid of one language in the study of another is only incidental and unimportant". It makes a profound difference what the languages are. This student, trained in German, could make nothing of that paper, but, confronted with a Spanish test, administered under the same conditions and judged by the same Board, wrote a pass paper on the basis of the Latin background.

As between Latin as now taught and a Romance language there is unquestionably an immense amount of 'transfer', if the Investigators would but look for it, instead of trying to close their eyes to the patent facts of the case. Until this 'transfer' is impartially and adequately measured, we are by no means inclined to join in Dr. Gray's "contention" that no appreciable amount of transfer can be hoped for unless we abandon the study of Latin as now taught, and make it merely

²These facts are transmitted by a former pupil of the writer and a personal friend of the individual.

the avenue for certain intensively cultivated by-products.

How extensive and intricate an adequate test would necessarily be is indicated by the experience of a pupil of the writer. It is a matter of common report that students who take only a modern foreign language in School quickly forget what they have learned, unless there is actual need for the use of the language. The case that came under my observation was that of a woman with a background of Latin, who, after some years of disuse of elementary French, was able to enter and hold her own in advanced University courses in that subject.

This suggests the query whether or not the Latin background tends to hold and fix a pupil's knowledge of French or Spanish. Of course, Professor Starch and others would be quite ready to suggest that it is 'probable' that the student's aptitude in this particular case explains everything. But we are not interested in what Professor Starch thinks is probable. There are solid facts here waiting for investigation; and it will be well to withhold a verdict until all the evidence is in⁴.

(4) and (5). Whether the best teachers would care to continue the work, if obliged to surrender Latin as an end and to substitute various sorts of training in other things, is a question that only they can answer.

No doubt is entertained as to what may be accomplished in Dr. Gray's own School—his success may be as great as that of Dr. Rouse with the Direct Method. But that does not mean that these methods are for everyone. Furthermore, it is, unfortunately, true that the Latin in many a small High School is in the hands of persons who are by no means qualified for the work, and who may even have been forced into it against their will. For these, at least, new methods requiring special training and aptitude would be extra hazardous.

(6) The emphasis which the present activity of the American Classical League is now placing upon educational measurements tends to obscure the fact that there are other fields of investigation calling imperatively for attention.

Thus, the changed constituency of the High School is in itself a distinct menace to the general maintenance of Latin in the Secondary School curriculum. In many Schools the great majority of the pupils have vocational aims, or no special aim at all. Under free election, exacting studies like Latin are shunned in favor of things that are more directly attractive and easy.

Most School Boards feel it necessary to provide first for the subjects largely elected; hence the rule

"One wonders whether Dr. Gray at bottom really subscribes to the doctrine that 'We train what we train', on which he (like the apostles of the Modern School) professes to raise his structure. If so, one queries what he means when, on pages 64-65, in his address to students, he says: 'So not only shall we find ourselves able to use Latin as a tool, but it will develop in us, if studied in the right way every day, a greater and greater power, which, once ours, we can employ in solving problems in other fields'. In this quotation, the Italics are mine.

It is worth observing, in passing, that psychologists of note are now challenging the doctrine 'We train what we train', and there are hopeful signs that sanity is about to return, leaving the Modern School high and dry. See Professor G. M. Stratton, *Atlantic Monthly*, March, 1921, especially page 369.

frequently heard, 'No class will be organized in any subject for which less than (twenty) students enroll'. Such a rule may automatically eliminate Cicero and Vergil from Schools of considerable size, and might banish Latin entirely from smaller Schools.

Often such results come about through no hostility at all on the part of the administration. It may be simply a matter of dollars. When the large groups of students are provided for, whence the money to secure a teacher for little classes in Latin for students who could be taken care of in other subjects with no additional expense?

How are we to convince School Boards that it is not right to deprive their brightest students of the opportunity to study the subjects best adapted to their need, in order to take care of a crowd of students who are aiming at nothing in particular? While this question remains unanswered, and while we are discussing methods of teaching, the deadly work of eliminating Latin goes steadily on. Of course, matters are aggravated when the administration is actively hostile, as may be seen by contrasting the two following cases.

Case 1. A classical teacher was engaged to teach French in a small High School. Arriving on the ground, he found a little demand for Latin, and, with the consent of the administration, withdrew the French, substituted Latin—and enrolled half the School in the course.

Case 2. The scene is another small High School, but with a principal who hates culture and everything pertaining to a University, and who is himself a laughing-stock because of his ignorance of English. A teacher of Latin and Spanish was engaged, whose first choice was Latin. The principal, however, announced that the School in question had no place for Latin, and that all students desiring to study a foreign language must elect Spanish. Hence, there is no Latin in that School.

In regard to these two cases it will be noted that the question of method does not enter at all. On the one side the decisive factor is the devoted teacher, on the other it is a barbarian principal.

It may be claimed, of course, that an extreme program such as Dr. Gray has in mind may tend to flatter the educational 'expert' and placate the barbarian principal. But, if these ends are to be gained only by a wholly unwarranted attack upon legitimate aims and methods in teaching Latin, and in an abandonment of the study of Latin as an end in itself⁴, we may well pause to count the cost before entering upon such a program.

It is true, too, that Dr. Gray states (55):

... It is confidently believed that the program proposed for the great majority will be found the best basis for those also who are to pursue their classical studies further and become, as always, the leaders in the realm of thought and literature.

But this is merely the expression of a pious hope (entirely natural to the advocate of a new method), and it

⁴The exact meaning of this phrase, and Dr. Gray's treatment of this subject would require more space than can properly be claimed here.

carries little conviction to one who is forever hearing the plaints of teachers that they now can scarcely bring their classes through on schedule time, because of the distractions from the business in hand. As a matter of fact, the proposed program seems all of a piece with the general High School policy above noted, whereby the interests of the talented few are sacrificed to the supposed or real needs of the many.

It is earnestly hoped that the American Classical League will early see its way to grapple with the administrative difficulties that now are throttling Latin in many Schools. The problem is a difficult one; but just for that reason it demands the more earnest attention.

In any case, the League will strengthen its position with the classical public, if it will make it clear at the start that its final report will include no bitter and unjustified attack upon the present methods and aims of Latin teaching. A really better program needs only to be advertised, and teachers will be quick to recognize its merits.

In the second place, the disastrous results of hasty reconstruction on the basis of supposed results of educational tests make it very desirable that assurance be given that no attempt will be made to force upon the Schools generally any program that the survey may seem to support. For a period of years any radically new program should be tried out in a very few Schools, including some where the conditions are merely average. If the program justifies itself here, then other Schools may be expected to take it up.

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

H. C. NUTTING

DR. GRAY'S REPLY TO PROFESSOR NUTTING

With regard to the article criticized by Professor Nutting permit me to quote from letters which I wrote to him under the dates of February 11, and March 8.

The article was written over a year ago and accepted for publication by The Classical Journal before I was even a member of the Investigating Committee. It has nothing whatever to do with the Investigation, either theoretically or practically. It represents a purely *a priori* attack upon the problem and expresses convictions that have grown out of experience, although this experience has never been checked up by any scientific study. So far as the relationship of the principles which I discussed in that article to the present Investigation is concerned, it is distinctly that of submitting conclusions reached on deductive bases to tests of an inductive nature. Certainly nothing could be farther from the spirit of scientific research which characterizes this Investigation than that anyone's views previously conceived should in any way direct it or affect it. It is precisely the converse that must inevitably be the case, and I am frank to say that this article, written over a year ago, would, if written today as a purely personal article, undergo considerable modification in the light of evidence that is already accumulating from this Investigation. . . .

Must it be necessary to have an Investigating Committee composed of people who have no convictions? If they are to have convictions, must these convictions be approved of in advance? In that case

the course of the Investigation would certainly be predetermined. But I wish to disabuse your mind entirely of the idea that I have any fixed convictions which are not susceptible to modifications, revision, or rejection in the light of evidence disclosed. I feel reasonably sure that you have convictions as strong as mine and I feel confident that they are held subject to the same reservation....

I think you will agree with me that the present Investigation does include within its scope precisely what you demand—"an adequate experiment designed to bring out the value of Latin as taught".

There are many points in Dr. Nutting's article with which I entirely disagree, but it does not seem profitable to continue the discussion on the basis of personal opinion, when it is precisely the function of the Investigation now in progress to provide accurate factual data from which sound conclusions may be drawn.

MASON D. GRAY

CLASSICAL ARTICLES IN NON-CLASSICAL PERIODICALS

V

Abhandlungen der Königlichen Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen, Philologisch-Historische Klasse—XVII, 2, Ueberlieferung und Entstehung der Theokrit-Scholien, Carl Wendel.

American Catholic Quarterly Review—April, 1921, Four Famous Sons of Ceres, Harriette Wilbur; Mediaeval Latin Proverbs, Darley Dale.

American Judicature Society, Journal of the—Dec., Speedy Justice in Ancient Rome, Albert Kocourek [the author holds that the formula system has never been equalled since those days].

Anglican Theological Review—Aug., The Life and Letters of St. Paul, David Smith, reviewed by Frederick C. Grant; A Grammar of New Testament Greek, James Hope Moulton, reviewed by A. Haire Forster; Dictionary of the Vulgate New Testament, J. M. Harden, reviewed by A. Haire Forster.

Atlantic Monthly—Oct., The Iron Man, Arthur Pound [an article characterized by The World's Work, Dec., as "a plea for cultural education from another quarter"].

Contemporary Review—Dec., Roman Private Law, W. W. Buckland, reviewed by J. E. G. De Montmorency.

Göttingische Gelehrte Anzeigen—July-September, Opferritus und Veropfer der Griechen und Römer, S. Eitrem, reviewed by Otto Weinreich.

Independent and Weekly Review—Dec. 31, An Unnecessary question, Henry W. Bunn [in this article, under the caption "Cabbages and Kings", the author commends the translation of Lucian by H. W. Fowler and F. G. Fowler, and uses an incident from Lucian to illustrate a modern matter]; The Reign of the Revue, Robert Allerton Parker [the author traces the "great tradition" of the Revue, beginning with Aristophanes].

Journal of Education (London)—Nov., The <Prime Minister's> Committee on Classics [correspondence: comment, adverse, on the Committee's Report. "Spectator" takes exception to the statement of this Committee that "Latin and Greek are severe trainers of the observation", and insists that the fact "that such a claim is made for Classics without even a hint that the whole subject is controversial, suggests that advanced classical scholarship is not incompatible with ignorance of contemporary thought"].

Man—Nov., Les Tombes des Martres-de-Veyre, Aug. Audollent [a discussion of relics of the Gallo-Roman civilization of the first or second century of our era].

Mind—Oct., The Works of Aristotle, in the translation edited by W. D. Ross, reviewed by A. E. Taylor, as follows: Volume X, *Polities*, translated by Benjamin Jowett [has "notable merits" and "occasional demerits"], *Oeconomica*, by E. S. Forster, *Atheniensium Respublica*, by Sir F. G. Kenyon [has fidelity as a translation and excellence as literature].

Nation and Athenaeum—Oct. 29, The Price of Roman Success [unsigned review of *Agricola, A Study of Agricultural Life in the Graeco-Roman World from the Point of View of Labour*, W. E. Heitland. The book is "packed with information.... Nothing is more interesting than the discussion of the kind of society that the Republic became under the stimulus of a knock-out victory and unearned wealth.... Agriculture ceased to be in the Latin phrase a mother of men from the day when first Rome was flooded with the great indemnities and she learnt how to live on others. Against this fundamental difficulty Roman statesmanship was fighting a losing battle all its life"].—Nov. 12, The New Humanism [the defect of the English educational system, the author declares, is superficiality. "There is scarcely a school of any type that does not neglect English to a degree that is little short of shameful.... The places of higher education are limited by the snobbish tradition that the only languages becoming to a gentleman are Greek and Latin, and that ignorance of classics and knowledge of English may be taken as a sign of doubtful social standing". This remarkable statement is followed by three quotations—one from Dean Gaisford and two from F. W. H. Myers—which purport to prove or at least to illustrate it, but which really do not do so in the least].—Nov. 26, The Passing of the Greeks [unsigned review of *Histoire de l'Art: L'Art Antique*, Elie Faure, which holds that "the so-called golden period of Greek art was no more than an episode in the growth of art", and that "late Greek art", to which the reviewer seems to assign Praxiteles's 'Venus', was "frankly sensuous". The complete statues which we possess are, "relatively speaking, failures", for they fail to "arouse and retain emotion in the open air". The work contains "excellent comparative tables and a series of most intelligent essays on Egyptian, Assyrian, Greek, and Roman art"].—Dec. 3, Athens and London, H. J. L. [review of Essays and Addresses, Gilbert Murray: "he has always been a fighter in the struggle for liberal-mindedness"]; Some Greek Salvage [unsigned review of *New Chapters in the History of Greek Literature: Recent Discoveries in Greek Poetry and Prose of the Fourth and Following Centuries* B. C., edited by J. U. Powell and E. A. Barker; the review, which is largely given over to a discussion of Menander—an article on The New Menander, and Other New Fragments of the New Comedy, by T. W. Lumb, covers pages 66-98 of the book—finds learning and acumen in E. M. Walker's essay on Aristotle's treatise on the "Athenian Constitution", but criticizes unfavorably the choice of material, the failure to supply English versions for all cited passages, and the English written by some of the ten contributors].

Nineteenth Century and After—Dec., Greek in Extremis, A. D. Godley ["The whole future of Greek lies on the knees of schoolmasters"].

Nouvelle Revue—Nov. 15, Monuments Grecs en Sicile, Henry Petiot [concluded from October 15].

HUNTER COLLEGE

E. ADELAIDE HAHN
HELEN H. TANZER